

מס. 336

נשלח: 261800 יוני 74

אל : לונדון

מאת: המשרד

מ י י י

להלן נוסח מאמרו של יורם דינסטין עם מכתב מלורה כחשובה למאמר פליציה לנגר.
דינסטין ישלח מחר בבוקר אח המכתב אקספרס למערכת.

ENCLOSED PLEASE FIND A RESPONSE TO FELICIA LANGER'S ARTICLE - ENTITLED "IS THIS THE WAY TO PEACE BETWEEN JEW AND ARAB?" - PUBLISHED IN YOUR PAPER OF 17 JUNE (PAGE 12).

I TRUST THAT, IN THE INTERESTS OF FAIRNESS AND EQUAL TIME, YOU WILL FIND IT POSSIBLE TO PUBLISH MY RESPONSE, EITHER AS A LETTER TO THE EDITOR OR IN ANY OTHER APPROPRIATE WAY. I AM FULLY AWARE OF THE FACT THAT THE RESPONSE IS RATHER LENGTHY, BUT I DO NOT THINK THAT YOU CAN DO JUSTICE TO THE SUBJECT IN A MORE ABBREVIATED FORM. I MUST THEREFORE INSIST THAT NO SUBSTANTIAL PART OF THE RESPONSE BE EXCISED IF ACCEPTED FOR PUBLICATION.

I SHOULD HOPE THAT SOME OF THE FACTS AND FIGURES ADDUCED IN MY RESPONSE WILL COME AS A SURPRISE TO YOUR READERS. THEY CERTAINLY COLLIDE HEAD-ON WITH FELICIA LANGER'S VERSION.

PROFESSOR YORAM DINSTEIN

EDITOR, ISRAEL YEARBOOK ON HUMAN RIGHTS

CHAIRMAN, ISRAEL NATIONAL SECTION OF AMNESTY INTERNATIONAL.

"CONFUSING THE READERS BY FACTS?"

AS CHAIRMAN OF THE ISRAEL NATIONAL SECTION OF AMNESTY INTERNATIONAL, I WAS APPALLED TO READ IN YOUR PAPER OF 17 JUNE (PAGE 12) THAT TORTURE IS FREELY PRACTICED BY ISRAELI AUTHORITIES IN THE OCCUPIED TERRITORIES. AS A JURIST, HOWEVER, THE TRADITIONAL LAWYERLY QUESTION SPRANG UP IN MY MIND: WHAT IS THE SOURCE OF YOUR EVIDENCE? AS A STUDENT OF HUMAN RIGHTS, I WAS SOMEWHAT PUZZLED TO SEE THAT THE AUTHOR OF YOUR ARTICLE IS A MEMBER OF THE CENTRAL COMMITTEE OF THE ISRAEL "NEW" (I.E. MOSCOW-ORIENTED) COMMUNIST PARTY: AFTER ALL, FUNCTIONARIES OF COMMUNIST PARTIES ARE NOT WIDELY REGARDED AS STANDARD-BEARERS IN THE FIELD OF FUNDAMENTAL FREEDOMS. AS AN ACADEMIC, I WAS STRUCK BY THE INHERENT INCONSISTENCIES (OCCASIONALLY, INCONGRUITIES) IN THE WHOLE STORY. THUS, FOR INSTANCE, WE ARE TOLD THAT "FOR SEVERAL YEARS" THOUSANDS OF PEOPLE HAVE BEEN LANGUISHING IN ISRAELI JAILS, AND, AT THE SAME TIME, WE LEARN THAT SUBSEQUENT TO THE OCTOBER WAR "INTERMENT HAS BEEN BROUGHT BACK TO LIFE" AFTER A SHARP DECLINE IN THE PRE-WAR PERIOD. FINALLY, AS A READER, INTERESTED IN HIS OWN PART OF THE WORLD, THE INEVITABLE QUESTION THAT OCCURRED TO ME WAS ONE OF PLAIN COMMON SENSE: IF CONDITIONS IN THE OCCUPIED TERRITORIES ARE SO UNBEARABLE, HOW COME THAT TENS OF THOUSANDS OF ARABS - WHOLE FAMILIES, INCLUDING WOMEN AND CHILDREN - WHO ARE PRIVILEGED TO LIVE ACROSS THE JORDAN RIVER AND BEYOND THE ISRAELI REACH, ARE NOW

-2-

VOLUNTARILY POURING INTO THE TERRITORIES WITH A VIEW TO SPENDING THE SUMMER VACATION THERE? WHAT PERVERSION OF HUMAN NATURE IS DRAWING THESE MULTITUDES INTO THE VORTEX OF UNSPEAKABLE MALTREATMENT? WHY DO THEY FREELY CHOOSE TO VACATION IN A NAZI-LIKE ATMOSPHERE?

THE POINT IS THAT THE NAZI-LIKE ATMOSPHERE EXISTS ONLY IN THE FERTILE IMAGINATION OF ARAB AND SOVIET PROPAGANDISTS, INCLUDING FELICIA LANGER, WHO PAID IN HER ARTICLE CLOSER ATTENTION TO THE PARTY-LINE THAN TO TRUTH. IT IS UNFORTUNATE THAT A PRESTIGIOUS NEWSPAPER LIKE THE TIMES HAS LENT ITS NAME TO SUCH A SPURIOUS REPORT. I CAN ASSURE YOU, BY WAY OF ILLUSTRATION, THAT THE ENTIRELY FICTITIOUS FIGURE OF 18,000 HOUSES ALLEGEDLY DEMOLISHED SINCE THE OCCUPATION STARTED IN 1967 WILL NOW BE CITED BY ARAB SPOKESMEN THE WORLD OVER, AND ATTRIBUTED DIRECTLY TO THE TIMES. MIND YOU, IF 18,000 BUILDINGS WERE REALLY DESTROYED WITHIN THE CONFINES OF THE RELATIVELY SMALL AREA UNDER OCCUPATION, THE WEST BANK WOULD HAVE LOOKED LIKE COVENTRY AFTER THE BLITZ. SURELY, THE TIMES' OWN CORRESPONDENTS WOULD NOT HAVE BEEN REMISS IN THEIR DUTY BY REPORTING SUCH LARGE-SCALE DEVASTATION, HAD IT BEEN SUBSTANTIATED BY FACTS.

SOME PEOPLE DO NOT LIKE TO BE CONFUSED BY FACTS. I TRUST, HOWEVER, THAT YOUR READERS WILL NOT MIND HAVING SOME OF THE PERTINENT FACTS BROUGHT TO LIGHT.

A. ADMINISTRATIVE DETENTION.

IN 1973, ON THE EVE OF THE YOM KIPPUR WAR, THE TOTAL NUMBER OF ADMINISTRATIVE DETAINEES IN THE OCCUPIED TERRITORIES WAS LESS THAN 20 (TWENTY). SINCE THE WAR, AND AS A RESULT OF THE RECENT ARAB TERRORIST OFFENSIVE, THIS NUMBER HAS SLIGHTLY INCREASED. THE SUGGESTION THAT INNOCENT PEOPLE ARE DETAINED FOR "GIVING A GLASS OF WATER" TO SUSPECTS OR FOR "PEACEFUL DEMONSTRATIONS" IS TOO LUDICROUS TO MERIT SERIOUS CONSIDERATION. DETENTIONS ARE, OF COURSE, USED TO PREVENT GENOCIDAL ATROCITIES SUCH AS THOSE TAKING PLACE IN KIRYAT SHEMONA AND MA'ALOT, WHICH FELICIA LANGER - WITH HER FELICITOUS, THOUGH SELECTIVE, CONCERNS ABOUT HUMAN SUFFERING - MANAGES COMPLETELY TO IGNORE.

B. DEMOLITION OF BUILDINGS.

ALL IN ALL, THE NUMBER OF BUILDINGS DEMOLISHED BY THE ISRAELI AUTHORITIES SINCE THE OCCUPATION BEGAN IS IN THE ORDER OF MAGNITUDE OF SEVERAL HUNDREDS. AGAIN, DEMOLITIONS HAD BECOME EXCEEDINGLY RARE BEFORE THE WAR, AND ONLY LATELY DID THE MILITARY COMMAND RESORT TO THEM ONCE MORE. ADMITTEDLY, THIS IS A CONTROVERSIAL MEASURE - ISRAEL AS WELL AS ABROAD BUT IT IS IMPORTANT TO BEAR IN MIND THAT IT SERVES AS A SUBSTITUTE FOR CAPITAL PUNISHMENT, WHICH IS NOT EXERCISED EITHER IN ISRAEL OR IN THE OCCUPIED TERRITORIES. IN ANY EVENT, THE AUTHORITIES NOW TEND - MORE OFTEN THAN NOT - TO LOCK UP BUILDINGS USED BY TERRORISTS, IN LIEU OF DEMOLISHING THEM, THEREBY OPENING THE POSSIBILITY (UTILIZED ALREADY IN MANY CASES) OF AMNESTY AT A LATER STAGE.

C. DEPORTATIONS.

THE OVER-ALL NUMBER OF DEPORTEES SINCE 1967 DOES NOT EXCEED 100. DEPORTATIONS HAD VIRTUALLY BEEN DISCONTINUED ON THE EVE OF THE WAR, BUT HAVE NOW BEEN RESUMED IN RARE INSTANCES. FAR FROM FACING THE FIRING SQUAD, AS OBLIQUELY SUGGESTED BY FELICIA LANGER, MOST OF THE DEPORTEES ARE WELCOMED BY THE KINGDOM OF JORDAN AS

HEROES, AND SOME OF THEM HAVE BEEN AWARDED HIGH OFFICIAL POSTS. PERSONALLY, I DO NOT APPROVE OF DEPORTATIONS, BUT THE ISSUE MUST BE SEEN IN ITS PROPER PERSPECTIVE.

CANARDS ABOUT TORTURE OF ARABS IN THE OCCUPIED TERRITORIES HAVE BEEN SPREAD SINCE 1967. BUT WHENEVER PUT TO THE TEST OF AN ACTUAL ENQUIRY, THEY EXPLODED WITHOUT LEAVING A TRACE. A FAMOUS CASE IN POINT IS THAT OF MOHAMMED ABDEL KADIR DERBES, WHO CLAIMED THAT HE HAD BEEN ARRESTED AND CASTRATED, NO LESS. OFFICIAL EGYPTIAN MEDICAL DOCUMENTS HAVE IN THE MEANTIME BEEN PUBLISHED, CERTIFYING THAT THE MAN'S GENITALS HAD BEEN REMOVED BY SURGERY IN THE NASSER HOSPITAL PRIOR TO THE OCCUPATION. MOHAMMED SALAMAN OTWAN'S COMPLAINT, AS REPORTED BY FELICIA LANGER, SEEMS NOT ENTIRELY DISSIMILAR, EXCEPT THAT NO PERMANENT DAMAGE IS CONTENDED AND THE WHOLE CHARGE IS NOT VERIFIABLE. IN THE FINAL ANALYSIS, THE ISSUE BOILS DOWN TO CREDIBILITY: DO YOU BELIEVE

OTWAN'S STORY (OR FELICIA LANGER'S VERSION OF IT)? FOR MY PART, I CONFESS THAT I DO NOT. ON THE WHOLE, I FIND THE DUBIOUS CHARGES TO BE MALAPROPOS AT A TIME WHEN ISRAELI PRISONERS-OF-WAR, HAVING BEEN SUBJECTED TO THE MOST BARBAROUS OF TREATMENT IN SYRIA, ARE LIMPING BACK HOME MAIMED AND INJURED FOR LIFE. IS FELICIA LANGER'S HEART OBTUSE WHEN JEWS ARE PUT TO TORTURE BY "PROGRESSIVE" ARABS?

THE TROUBLE WITH FELICIA LANGER'S EXCURSION INTO THE MYTHOLOGICAL DOMAIN IS INDICATED IN THE TITLE OF HER ARTICLE: DISSIMULATION CAN HARDLY PROMOTE PEACE BETWEEN JEW AND ARAB. INSTEAD OF COMING TO GRIPS WITH THE REAL PROBLEMS OF THE OCCUPATION - AND THEY ARE NOT NEGLIGIBLE - SHE DISSEMINATES FANCIFUL TALES. INSTEAD OF POINTING OUT WAYS AND MEANS FOR PAVING THE ROAD TO CO-EXISTENCE, SHE ADDS FUEL TO THE FIRE OF MUTUAL DISTRUST. HOPEFULLY, SOME DAY PEACE WILL COME TO OUR AREA. WHEN IT DOES, IT WILL COME NOT BECAUSE, BUT IN SPITE OF, SUCH IRRESPONSIBLE ARTICLES.

PROFESSOR YORAM DINSTEIN

EDITOR, ISRAEL YEARBOOK ON HUMAN RIGHTS CHAIRMAN,
ISRAEL NATIONAL SECTION OF AMNESTY INTERNATIONAL

הסכרה

שהחיה מנכל מ/מנכל סמנכל מעת הסכרה אירועה בי אר"אל מאומ א/ב
מזתים חקר

מַלְגוּם דִּם אִמֵּן וְרַדִּי